



A Historical Perspective Towards Sports and Leisure Time: Intelligence Practices from 19th Century to Present

Spor ve Serbest Zaman Faaliyetlerine Tarihsel Bir Bakış Açısı: 19. Yüzyıldan Günümüze İstihbarat Uygulamaları

M. Onur Ak* 



* Dr., Bağımsız Araştırmacı
Ankara, Türkiye
ORCID No: 0000-0003-1434-2207

Sorumlu yazar/Corresponding author:
M. Onur Ak
Ankara, Türkiye
E-posta/E-mail: monurak@gmail.com

Başvuru/Submitted: 09.05.2022
Revizyon Talebi/Revision Requested:
06.06.2022
Son Revizyon/Last Revision Received:
06.10.2022
Kabul/Accepted: 20.10.2022
Yayınlanma/publication: 25.10.2022

Atıf/Citation:

Ak, M. Onur, "A Historical Perspective Towards Sports and Leisure Time: Intelligence Practices from 19th Century to Present", *Tarihin Peşinde Uluslararası Tarih ve Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, S. 28, (2022), 208-234.

ABSTRACT

In this study, the intelligence practices in sports and leisure time are discussed. As a result of the efforts to create a nation-state identity, which became common in the world after the French Revolution, the development of the use of free time activities for intelligence purposes, from the 19th century to the present, is examined. The attempts to serve the hybrid war strategies in the changing world conjuncture with the process experienced and the developing technology are mentioned. Practical examples related to the subject are stated within the scope of the measures taken by policymakers and state institutions.

Keywords: *Sports, Leisure, Recreation, Intelligence, History.*

ÖZ

Bu çalışma kapsamında, istihbaratın spor ve serbest zaman özelindeki uygulama biçimine değinilmiştir. Fransız İhtilali'nden sonra dünyada son derece popüler bir hale gelen ulus-devlet kimliği oluşturma çabaları neticesinde, serbest zaman faaliyetlerinin istihbarat amaçlı kullanımının 19. Yüzyıldan başlayacak şekilde günümüze kadar gelişimi ele alınmıştır. Bunun yanında özellikle gelişen teknolojiyle birlikte yaşanan bu sürecin, değişen dünya konjonktüründeki hibrit savaş stratejilerine hizmet etmesi yönündeki girişimler de ele alınarak politika yapıcılarının ve devlet kurumlarının bu hususlarla ilgili aldığı tedbirler kapsamında konuyla ilgili uygulamalı örnekler belirtilmiştir.

Anahtar sözcükler: *Spor, Serbest zaman, Rekreasyon, İstihbarat, Tarih.*



Introduction

How the concept of life started, and spread is tried to be explained by the researchers In addition to the modern technological advances of, the findings of the past take on a more concrete structure with the increase of experience gained in fields such as archaeology and anthropology. Starting from the first era, humanity has brought the flow of life up to these days with the experiences of collective life from the past. Human beings have made progress in every subject that his/her mind is capable of. However, these advances have sometimes created various divergences. Undoubtedly, the human factor is at the centre of these divergences, which emerged as language, religion, race, culture and borders. At every stage of his/her life, humankind has tried to understand what is happening around them and to solve the developments that would threaten their survival. The basic element of this effort is the need to collect information about what they want to learn.¹ In the historical process, people have not only consciously or involuntarily applied information-gathering activities in line with their needs, but also continued these activities in a systematic and organized manner, especially with the determination of country borders and the emergence of the concepts of allies and enemies.²

At the very beginning of the historical process, while the first human beings who tried to live alone, or in a community in nature struggled to find food and shelter to maintain their lives, they tried to take nature under control, and dominate it. In line with this purpose, they started to seek information gathering in order to learn what is going on around them and to develop a precautionary mechanism against possible developments and threats. They have improved their abilities to gather information with developments such as protection from natural events, hunting, shelter, fire, wheels and agriculture.



Picture 1. Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division⁴

“Das von süßer Friedens-Ruh schlaffend, und über heuntigen Welt- und Kriegs-Lauff Träumende Deutschland”. Print showing historical figures, scenes and symbols relating to the Thirty Years’ War. Between 1610 and 1650.

¹ Britta Renner, “Curiosity About People: The Development Of a Social Curiosity Measure in Adults”, *Journal Of Personality Assessment* 83 (2006), p. 308.

² M.Onur Ak, Toplumsal Cinsiyet Bağlamında Tarihsel Bakış Açısı ile Kadın ve Spor [Women and Sports with a Historical Perspective in the Context of Gender], in *Spor Bilimlerinde Teori ve Araştırmalar II [Theory and Research in Sport Sciences II]*, Gece Yayınları, Ankara 2020, p. 303-322.



With the peace of Westphalia in 1648, which is shown as the origins of modern borders between countries, state sovereignty in the national sense began to be seen as a fundamental right.^{3,4} With the separation of countries by certain borders and with Westphalia, the foundation of today's international relations was laid. With the emergence of the concept of the state, intelligence practices have become a discipline with various methods. As a result of the integration of the methods applied, the experiences gained in the information-gathering and evaluation process with the developing technology, intelligence is now a living organism. The phenomenon of intelligence is a constantly working cog. Countries evaluate and implement their intelligence-gathering activities within the scope of policies to be followed in the short and long term. Today, these activities are applied against countries and elements that are seen as a threat in the determination of the intelligence targets of the countries. It is of vital importance to be informed about the events that may occur in advance, especially in matters that may affect the national security of the countries, and to implement the measures. The point to be noted here is that intelligence is not just about gathering news. The information obtained must be processed and evaluated within a certain plan. Confidentiality is the most important and fundamental feature of intelligence.⁵

As proof of the rightness of the word of the famous Greek philosopher Heraclitus (535-475 B.C.), who stated "the only thing that does not change is the change itself," the world is now in a phase where change is experienced much faster. The concept of intelligence is also affected by these changes, like many other issues. Although these developments, in particular, did not affect the need to collect information, which is the basis of intelligence, they changed the methods in the information-gathering and evaluation processes. Advances in technology have formed the main point of the changes in these processes.

I. The Origin and History of Intelligence

According to former British intelligence officer Michael Herman, intelligence is one of the oldest professions in the world.⁶ This view was also endorsed by Ephraim Halevy, one of the former heads of the Mossad.⁷ In support of this situation, the first people saw the elements in the environment as threats or the things they can protect themselves from nature. We can think of methods as actions in which information-gathering activities within the scope of intelligence are carried out unorganized. However, it is not known when the first institutional organization for intelligence purposes was formed. The book called *The Art of War* by Sun Tzu, a Chinese philosopher and a commander sheds light on us as the first concrete work on this subject. Considered as the oldest intelligence document by intelligence circles, this work still maintains its validity in the modern era in terms of the origin and basis of intelligence.⁸ During the 7th century BC, the Persian Empire's experienced employees of intelligence developed themselves in this field. In the 5th century, the Athenians used intelligence more effectively and defeated the Persians in the war between Persia and Athenians as an example.⁹ Examples of the use of

³ Daniel Philpott, "Westphalia, Authority, and International Society", *Political Studies* XLVII (1999), p.270.

⁴ Library of Congress, The Peace of Westphalia, <https://blogs.loc.gov/law/2017/10/the-peace-of-westphalia/> (Date of access: 30.04.2022)

⁵ Abram N. Shulsky and Gary J. Schmitt, *Silent Warfare Understanding the World of Intelligence*, Brassey's, Washington 1993, p. 122.

⁶ Mevlüde Gökçen D. Darıcı, "Intelligence Activities in the Ottomans", (PhD Thesis, Sivas Cumhuriyet University, 2018), p. 3.

⁷ RT, "World Better not Pry Into How We Decide to Pull Trigger on Someone – Ex-Chief of Mossad", <https://www.rt.com/shows/sophico/370707-mossad-counter-terrorism-methods/> (Date of access: 15.10.2021)

⁸ Michael Warner, "The Divine Skein: Sun Tzu on Intelligence", *Intelligence and National Security* 21, no.4 (2007), p. 485.

⁹ B.H. Liddell Hart, *The Classical Book on Military Strategy (2nd Edition)*, Meridian Publishing, New York 1991, p.44; Adda B. Bozeman, *Strategic Intelligence and Statecraft*, Brassey's, New York 1992). p.26.



intelligence in the past are found not only in war records but also in sacred religious books. The activities of Moses such as sending 12 men to the Canaan region and collecting information about the strategic characteristics of the individuals living there the place they live can be given as an example.¹⁰ In the story, which is referred to as the Companions Kehf in Islam and the Seven Sleepers in Christianity, it is told that these people go to the desired region after staying in a cave for a long time and gathering information.¹¹

Intelligence is a concept that has co-existed with human beings and continues to exist. As mentioned above, its practices have been seen all over the world from past to present. It is inevitable that there will be various definitions of the activity in question, which has been actively used for centuries in such a wide geography. The definition of intelligence may differ according to the cultures of the regions and the nations in these regions. This culture consists of the current security perception of the country, as well as the ongoing cultures of the intelligence services in that region for years. Therefore, it is quite natural to make different definitions depending on the culture. Important clues about the perspectives of countries on intelligence activities can be seen in the use of the word intelligence. Looking at Asian and Arab cultures, "istihbarat", which is an Arabic word, means "newly learned news and information". In English, the word intelligence has the meanings of "intellect". In this respect, it is possible to see intelligence as the whole of news that is interpreted and analyzed using reason. There is a wide variety of explanations for the definition of intelligence. The diversity in the definition of the concept of intelligence arises from this versatility. Famous CIA analyst and historian Thomas F. Troy defines intelligence as information obtained from the enemy.¹² Kent, an intelligence theorist, considered that processed intelligence information directs national policies rather than a mere stack of information.¹³ If we need to make a common definition from the explanations mentioned above, we can say that the information gathered by using various techniques from all kinds of sources is used in line with the interests after the analysis and evaluation process.

With the emergence of the nation-state understanding and country borders, states have started to implement their intelligence activities in a more systematic and programmed way. Various examples can be given in this sense. The famous king of France, who fought against the understanding of aristocracy, XI. Louis (1423-1483) formed the basis of an exemplary intelligence network by using his small army of Scottish archers in information-gathering activities. Sir Francis Walsingham (1532-1590), who was the general secretary of Queen Elizabeth I of England and also served as a minister, ambassador and deputy at different times, applied effective intelligence methods by foreseeing the methods to be applied in the world intelligence services.¹⁴ Like the Russian Police Service, which was established during the reign of Ivan Vasilievich, or known as Ivan the Terrible (1530-1584), the gendarmerie organization during the reign of Tsar Nicholas I (1825-1855) is essentially an intelligence service that works to ensure the continuity of the regime and the Tsar IV. The remark of a Russian official to the British Ambassador, who was tried in the court of Ivan the Terrible, that "only spies come to

¹⁰ Torah, Numerus 13:1-23

¹¹ Mary Elizabeth Coleridge, *The Seven Sleepers of Ephesus*, Chatto&Windus, London 1893, p.18; Christian S. Krokus, "The Darkness is not Death: Toward a Christian-Muslim Comparative Theological Study of the Seven Sleepers of Ephesus", *Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality* 17, no.1 (2017), p. 48; Uri Bar Joseph, *Intelligence Intervention in The Politics of Democratic States, The United States, Israel And Britain*, Pennsylvania University Press, Pennsylvania 1999, p.34; Qur'an, Kehf:12.292-304.

¹² Thomas F. Troy, "The Correct Definition of Intelligence", *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence*, 5, no.4 (1991), p. 444.

¹³ Sherman Kent, *Strategic Intelligence For American World Policy*, Archon Books, U.S. 1965, p. 3.

¹⁴ John P.D. Cooper, *The Quenn's Agent: Francis Walsingham at the Court of Elizabeth I*, Faber and Faber, London 2011, p.12.



Russia" is an example of the extent to which intelligence goes back.¹⁵ With the French Revolution, the shaping of the modern world began and intelligence studies were also affected by this modernization. France desired to keep its army stronger in order to protect its lands. Its advanced development in the field of military intelligence was during the reign of the famous commander and politician Napoléon Bonaparte (1769-1821).¹⁶ In this period, Napoleon, who created a statistical unit in his military headquarters, used the strategic and operational-tactical elements of intelligence.¹⁷ The history of intelligence activities undoubtedly has its own roots in the USA as well. As a result of the Seven Years' War (1756-1763) between France and Great Britain, USA, which remained under British protection, revolted with the unification of 13 colonies and achieved independence under the leadership of the Founding Fathers. On the way to independence, decisions such as secret activities and the supply of secret weapons were carried out through the Committee of Secret Correspondence.¹⁸

"We shall from Time to Time furnish you with Intelligence of what is passing on this Continent in order that you may not only make good use thereof in the West Indies, but also transmit the same to Mr. Deane. It is of great Importance that He should be fully and frequently advised of what passes and as you may often have earlier and fuller Intelligence by means of News Papers and private Letters, than our Avocations will permit us to give, You will be on the Watch; send all Advices forward to Mr. Deane marking what you receive from us, what from private Letters, what from public Papers and what from Hearsay and always distinguishing between what you think can be depended on and what is doubtful. In short sir, you are to be constantly on the Watch, and give to Mr. Deane and us every Information that you think connected with the Interest or that can be improved to the Advantage of the United Colonies."

For this reason, the work of this committee can be shown as the beginning of the history of US intelligence.¹⁹ It is striking that George Washington used intelligence effectively during the US Revolution. In 1790, he was financed by the Congress for \$ 40,000 to coordinate intelligence activities.²⁰

In many different periods such as Huns, Mongols, and Ottomans, Turks have made use of intelligence activities in a two-thousand-year period in their history, stretching from the Pacific to the Mediterranean, from Beijing to Vienna, from Algeria to Troyes.²¹ It is known that the organized structures of the Turks were also used by the Ottoman Empire in order to convey the importance given to communication by the Turks and development in any part of the large-scale empire to the Centre as soon as possible.²²

As it can be understood, there is a need for information- gathering and demand for the use of intelligence in almost in every space used by people. It is seen that this need exists in

¹⁵ Mehmet Atay, "Russia Secret Intelligence Services: A Brief History of the KGB", *Avrasya* 8, no.2 (2002), p. 315; Robert W. Pringle, "The Heritage and Future of the Russian Intelligence Community", *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence*, 11, no.2 (1998), p. 178.

¹⁶ David Kahn, "Historical Theory of Intelligence", *Avrasya* 8(2) (2002), p. 8.

¹⁷ Ümit Özdağ, *İstihbarat Teorisi [Intelligence Theory]*, (Ankara: Kripto, 2014).

¹⁸ National Archives, The Committee of Secret Correspondence, <https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Franklin/> (Date of access: 22.11.2021)

¹⁹ D.D. Gries, "Openness and Secrecy", <https://www.cia.gov/static/b0b2b6a7ed15d42a0aacdb8d3f4a52e0/Openness-and-Secrecy.pdf>. (Date of access: 22.11.2021).

²⁰ J.Ransom Clark, *Intelligence and National Security a Reference Handbook*, Westport Praeger Security International, London 2007), p.6.

²¹ Jean Paul Roux, *Türklerin Tarihi: Pasifik'ten Akdeniz'e 2000 Yıl [Histoire Des Turcs - Deux mille ans du Pacifique a la Mediterranee]*, Artheme Fayard, France 2000, p. 23.

²² Necdet Aysal, "Çöküşten Mütakereye Osmanlı'da Haber Alma [From collapse to armistice intelligence in the Ottoman Empire]", *Journal of Atatürk's Road* 40 (2007), p. 530; Nizâmü'l-Mülk, *Siyâsetnâme [Policy]*, trans. Mehmet Taha Ayar, Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, İstanbul 2014, p.5.



every period, but it takes on a different structure with variables such as the relevant conjuncture, technology and bilateral relations. These variables manifest itself in I. and II. World Wars. For example, there were rapid developments in the field of intelligence during the I. World War. It is known that half a million people, 50 thousand of whom were spies, took part in intelligence activities during this period.²³



Picture 2.²⁴



Picture 3.²⁵

In World War II, the importance of intelligence was understood more and the most corporate intelligence services were established after this war.²⁶

II. Intelligence Cycle

Intelligence activities consist of instable and continuous processes. These continuous stages are expressed as the intelligence cycle. The intelligence cycle is defined as a process that defines activities aimed at transforming information into intelligence and meeting the needs of users.²⁷ When intelligence is considered as a whole, it is seen that it is pragmatic rather than doctrinal. In the typical version given by the Congressional Church Committee in 1976; those who use intelligence, i.e. consumers, specify the type of information needed. These needs are translated into concrete requirements by senior intelligence managers. The requirements are used to allocate resources to collectors and guide their efforts. The collectors obtain the necessary information or raw intelligence. Intelligence cycle is specified in which the final intelligence is collated and transformed into final intelligence by the analysts. Intelligence managers who specify new needs, define new requirements, and make necessary adjustments to intelligence programs to increase effectiveness and efficiency. Accordingly, the intelligence cycle

²³ Bernard Newman, *Alman Casusluğunun Esrarı [The Mystery of German Espionage]*, Altın Yayınevi, İstanbul 1940 quoted in Mehmet Gürbüz, *Amerikan İstihbaratının Tarihsel Gelişim Süreci ve Amerikan İstihbarat Topluluğu Modeli [Historical Development Process of American Intelligence and American Intelligence Community]*, (PhD Thesis, Police Academy Institute of Security Sciences, 2018), p. 3.

²⁴ Bridgeport Newspaper, <https://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn84022472/1917-04-13/ed-1/seq-17/> (Date of access: 22.01.2022).

²⁵ New York Public Library, <https://www.nypl.org/blog/2014/10/07/spies-among-us-wwi-apl> (Date of access: 22.01.2022).

²⁶ Michael Herman, *Intelligence Power in Peace and War*, Cambridge University Press, U.K. 1996, p. 24.

²⁷ Jeffrey T. Richelson, *The US Intelligence Community*, Westviews Press, Philadelphia 2012, p. 4.



traditionally consists of four parts: the determination of needs, the identification and direction of intelligence needs, the collection and analysis, and the dissemination. Apart from the traditional intelligence cycle, it is known that there are different forms of the intelligence cycle in the literature. Today, it consists of five stages: planning and management, collection, operation and process, analysis and production, and distribution and publication, together with national security policy practices compatible with the intelligence system. However, as a result of the developments in the field of management and organization in recent years, the "evaluation and feedback" phase has been included in the cycle as the sixth step.²⁸

Although there is no fundamental difference between the four-stage, five-stage and six-stage intelligence cycles, various interpretations are made about where the "analysis" should be placed on the cycle. The starting point here is that intelligence is an irreversible process, that is, a process that we know is used by the decision-makers of news-gathering, analysis and intelligence.²⁹

III. Use of Intelligence

Intelligence is an important and ever-changing practice by its nature. Although this practice has historically developed for states, merchants and clergy, the late 20th century witnessed the privatization of intelligence and surveillance equipment and the expansion of the concept of intelligence.³⁰ There is also diversity in terms of what, to whom, and how such a broad concept should be classified. Intelligence activities can be classified as economic, political, geographical, transportation, communication, military, social, technological and biographical intelligence.

III. 1. HUMINT (Human Intelligence) HUMINT relies on verbal and nonverbal communicative relationships, networks and interactions between individuals of political, military, economic or cultural significance. Psychology, cognitive science, sociology, anthropology, and humanities are some of the tools the HUMINT community uses to understand critical security events and processes in foreign countries. In short, it is gathered through spies.³¹ Not only ambassadors, military attachés, or government officials, but also traders, tourists, and students have historically served as cultural and national exchanges for human intelligence. Also, HUMINT is not a monopoly of the states. Private companies, banks, research laboratories and technology firms also conduct regular human intelligence operations to gain financial or scientific/technical superiority over their competitors.³²

III. 2. GEOINT (Geospatial Intelligence) Geography (weather, terrain, waterways) have always been important variables of intelligence analysis, GEOINT is specifically provided by satellites, unmanned aerial vehicles (UAV), light detection and measurement (LIDAR) and

²⁸ Abram N. Shulsky, *Silent Warfare Understanding the World of Intelligence*, Brassey's, Washington 1993, p. 2; Joint Publication, "Joint and National Intelligence Support to Military Operations 2-01", https://www.jcs.mil/Portals/36/Documents/Doctrine/pubs/jp2_01_20170705v2, p.169. (Date of access: 16.12. 2021).

²⁹ Savaş Biçer, "Transition from the Traditional Understanding of the National Security and Intelligence System to the Era of Modern and Changing Needs", *Black Sea Journal of Social Sciences* 9, no.2 (2017), p. 456.

³⁰ Akin H. Ünver, "Digital Open Source Intelligence and International Security", *Edam Cyber Politics and Digital Democracy* 7 (2018), p.7; Hakan Fidan, "Intelligence and Foreign Policy: A Comparison of British, American and Turkish Intelligence Systems", (Master Thesis, Bilkent University Graduate School of Economics and Social Sciences, 1999), p. 11.

³¹ Gabriel Margolis, "The Lack of HUMINT: A Recurring Intelligence Problem", *Global Security Studies*, 4, no.3 (2013), p. 55.

³² Jacqueline R. Evans, Christian A. Meissner, Susan E. Brandon, Melissa B. Russano and Steve M. Kleinman, "Criminal Versus Humint Interrogations: The Importance of Psychological Science to Improving Interrogative Practice", *The Journal of Psychiatry & Law* 38 (2010), p. 224.



surveillance aircraft.³³ GEOINT provides fixed or time-frequency image analysis for tracking and monitoring human activities as well as resources and subsurface conditions in a selected geographic area. The availability of special geospatial tools led to the establishment of the National Geospatial Agency (NGA) in the United States of America.³⁴

III. 3. MASINT (measurement and signature intelligence) Acoustic, radiofrequency, radiation, chemical/biological, and infrared signature, high-tech detection tools, can be examples of MASINT which focuses on the metric, angular, spatial, remote sensing methods of data collection.³⁵ Prior to 1991, most MASINT systems included embedded templates and acoustic libraries to aid in human-assisted automatic detection. Nowadays, with the help of artificial intelligence, machine learning and large acoustic detection data libraries, most MASINT systems have been developed to perform autonomous surveillance without the help of a human operator. Today, MASINT can be used in a wide range of information environments, from the detection of missiles, aeroplanes or unmanned aerial vehicles to disaster relief, refugee assistance monitoring and natural resource-industrial output measurements.³⁶

III. 4. FININT (Financial Intelligence) Financial intelligence focusing on terrorist financing, tax evasion, money laundering and illegal arms trade is about primarily how hostile actors plan on financing their operations and mapping the intermediary institutions and/or persons involving in the process.³⁷ FININT, as one of the most diverse schools of the intelligence discipline, serve more than one state body and does not depend solely on security or crisis-time decision-making. Long-term trends such as economic growth, industrial production, financial policies and econometric data, which do not need to be reacted with limited time or information and are accessible with open sources, are within the competence and field of activity of financial intelligence.³⁸

III. 5. SIGINT (Signal Intelligence) Although smoke, pigeons, light or semaphore signals have been used for a long time in history, the emergence of signal intelligence is mainly based on the discovery of the telegraph. SIGINT includes practices that include secretly connecting to communication networks and signal transmission channels for the purpose of ears dropping on enemy electronic communications, encryption of messages and encryption solutions. With the rapid development of communication technologies during the 20th century, signal intelligence has expanded to include TECHINT (technical intelligence), CYBINT (cyber intelligence) and DNINT (digital network intelligence) practices. Today, information, social media platforms and information and communication technologies spread over the vast internet are within the subject of signal intelligence. It is also at the forefront of modern internet-based information warfare, which includes bots, trolls and fake news.³⁹

³³ James R. Walker, "The Rise of GEOINT: Technology, Intelligence and Human Rights", *Visual Imagery and Human Rights Practice* (2018), p. 74.

³⁴ Todd S. Bacastow and D. Bellaio, "Redeining Geospatial Intelligence", *American Intelligence Journal* 27, no.1 (2009), p. 39.

³⁵ Patrick M. Hughes, "Masint", *American Intelligence Journal* 36, no.2 (2019), p. 8.

³⁶ Jeffrey T. Richelson, "Masint: The New Kid in Town", *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence* 14, no.2 (2001), p. 156.

³⁷ Milind Sathye and Chris Patel, "Developing Financial Intelligence: an Assessment of The FIUs in Australia and India", *Journal of Money Laundering Control* 10, no.4 (2007), p. 394.

³⁸ Donato Masciandaro, "Financial Supervisory Unification and Financial Intelligence Units", *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, 8, 4 (2005), p. 362.

³⁹ Matthew M. Aid, "All Glory is Fleeting: Sigint and the Fight Against International Terrorism", *Intelligence and National Security*, 18, 4 (2003), p. 104.



III. 6. OSINT (Open Source Intelligence) Although historically OSINT has been performed by news and information agencies, cultural and diplomatic exchanges, and socialization, it is increasingly being implemented based on the internet and technological developments. OSINT is basically intelligence gathered from open sources such as print media, news publications, magazines, books and the Internet. Today's most important source of intelligence is open sources. Thanks to what technology brings, it is possible to store, process and evaluate a large amount of information obtained from open sources.⁴⁰

The use of intelligence is seen in all areas of life. Many organizations such as institutions, companies, sports clubs, as well as states, engage in information gathering activities in order to determine their roadmap accordingly, by taking advance notice of the actions of their competitors.

Intelligence practices that provide information about competitors in various industries undoubtedly show themselves in the sports industry. Today, the global sports market is expressed with a market share of 440 billion dollars and this value is expected to reach 600 billion dollars by 2025.⁴¹ Determining and implementing competitive strategies in such a market is important for institutions to achieve their goals. Sports teams not only compete for players or coaches but also compete for sponsorship, new stadium and field constructions, domain naming rights, additional sports activities and fans. For example, in the United States, 62% of all team sports used the competitive intelligence function.⁴² In this study, apart from the mutual competition intelligence practices of sports organizations, information gathering methods used by states against each other by using sports and leisure time activities are discussed. At the same time, it should be underlined that sports should be examined not only for professional sportspeople but also for those who perform it as a recreational activity in their free time.⁴³ Within the scope of this article, while the intelligence information-gathering activities are examined, the use of the activities applied within the scope of both sports and leisure activities for intelligence purposes is explained.

IV. Information- Gathering Activities Used in Sports and Leisure Activities

Intelligence is indispensable for a country. Information-gathering activities for intelligence purposes, which are implemented in different ways within the scope of security policies, ensure that countries maintain their readiness without interruption.

Information collection activities conducted to prevent multiple threats that may appear, have a great importance in ensuring national security. In the historical development of intelligence activities, human resources maintain their importance despite all kinds of technological developments and negativities. Although the source of the information obtained today is mostly from open sources, the convenience of human resources, especially in the field, and its role in determining the real intentions of competitors make it an indispensable intelligence collection method. Information gathering activities for intelligence purposes appear in various

⁴⁰ Michael Glassman and Min Ju Kang, "Intelligence in the Internet Age: The Emergence and Evolution of Open Source Intelligence (OSINT)", *Computers in Human Behavior*, 28, 2 (2012), p. 675.

⁴¹ Researchandmarkets, "Sports Global Market Report 2021: COVID-19 Impact and Recovery to 2030", <https://www.researchandmarkets.com/reports/5240315/sports-global-market-report-2021>. (Date of access 02.11.2021).

⁴² Stephanie Hughes and Fred Beasley, "An Examination of the Existence and Usage of Competitive Intelligence in Professional Sports", *Journal of Competitive Intelligence and Management*, 4, 1 (2007), p. 95.

⁴³ M.Onur Ak, "Integration of Technology into Sports from the Perspective of Sport Management: The Case of Cybathlon", *Pearson Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 6, 16 (2021), p. 420.



forms. One of these different methods shows itself with human and technology-oriented studies under the name of sports and leisure time practices.

IV. 1. Scouting Activities

The emergence and spread of the concept of scouting in the world took place with the British General Baden Powell.⁴⁴ Adopting the natural life, Powell observed people during his duties in South Africa and various Mediterranean countries with a focus on the importance given to the youth. He thought that the young people who are in harmony with nature on the battlefields, to act with a certain discipline would benefit both themselves and the society they live in. When he returned to his country, he turned these thoughts into action by organizing the first scout camp with a group of 24 young people on Brownsea Island in 1907. In his book "Scouting for Boys", which he published in 1908 and translated into 35 languages, he explained the importance of educating the youth in nature with certain rules.⁴⁵ The book kept Powell's strategy on the youth, making them interested in scouting activities. So much so that the book has sold millions of copies all over the world in a short time. As a rising trend in the world, scouting has had an impact not only on boys but also on girls. The Girl Scout Organization was established by Baden Powell in 1910, and this organization continued its activities under the management of his wife Olive Powell.⁴⁶ The adventure of scouting, which started in England, soon became an organization adopted by everyone in Europe, under the name Eclaireur in France and Pfad Finder in Germany.⁴⁷

It is known that in the emergence of scouting activities, these activities did not occur only for the purpose of recreational activity but were effective in the context of movements such as the nation-state, citizen-soldier, and the importance of youth in the defence of the homeland due to the conditions of the period. Baden Powell, who integrated scouting with the knightly spirit of the medieval period, stated that during the war, Boer children in South Africa were accustomed to wildlife, knew how to survive in nature, and admired the advantage of tracking.⁴⁷ Therefore, it is accepted that scouting activities emerged with the aim of organizing the young mass in a paramilitary structure.

Scouting activities formerly belonged to an army's intelligence department and were a separate part of the field intelligence branch.⁴⁸ It is known that the scouts involved in the camps during the American Civil War that broke out at the end of the 19th century were involved in information gathering and espionage activities.⁴⁹ In addition, Harriet Ross Tubman, who provided information flow to the important commanders of the Northern Army during the American Civil War, applied successful disguise methods on her and engaged in espionage activities as a scout and nurse.⁵⁰ Both the Greeks and the Romans, individually or in groups of a few, took part in the task of collecting information, disguised, in the form of scouts (katas

⁴⁴ Allen Warren, "Sir Robert Baden-Powell, the Scout Movement and Citizen Training in Great Britain, 1900–1920", *The English Historical Review* (1986), p. 379.

⁴⁵ R. Baden Powell, *Scouting for Boys*, Dover Publishing, New York 1908, p. 26.

⁴⁶ Britannica, "1st Baron Baden-Powell", <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Robert-Stephenson-Smyth-Baden-Powell-1st-Baron-Baden-Powell> (Date of access: 03.11. 2021).

⁴⁷ Fredric W. Rohm and Bramwell Osula, "Scouting and Servant Leadership in Cross-Cultural Perspective: An Exploratory Study", *Journal of Virtues & Leadership*, 3, 1 (2013), p. 28.

⁴⁸ Arthur O. Vaughan, "Some Scouts-But not Scouting", *Longman's Magazine 1882-1905*, 43, 255 (1904), p. 234.

⁴⁹ William C. Davis, *Spies, Scouts and Raiders*, Time Life Education, U.S. 1986, p. 6.

⁵⁰ Kate C. Larson, "Harriet Ross Tubman: Timeline", *Meridians: Feminism, Race, Transnationalism*, 12, 2 (2014), p. 16.



kopi in Greek), which previously gathered information about the environment from the army units. These teams produced various scenarios and infiltrated the enemy side.⁵¹

Espionage and information- gathering activities under the name of scouting have been seen in various periods. Another example of this is the years that the Republic of Turkey spent under occupation before gaining its independence. In the reports presented by Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, the founder of the Republic of Turkey, while he was still in command of the army, Greek schools in Istanbul, which were under occupation, were used by a scout organization under the command of Greek officers. Financial aid was provided to this organization, and weapons and ammunition were stored in Fener and Tatavla churches.⁵²

In this period, the activities of the organization named Young Men's Christian Association (Y.M.C.A) draw attention with its free time and sports appearance, but with its missionary structure in the background. The Y.M.C.A movement officially started its first activities with the aim of "Christianize the whole world" with George Williams' Y.M.C.A. It started on June 6, 1844, the date when he officially founded the Y.M.C.A.⁵³ In 1856, stemming from the society, Y.W.C.A. a sister-girls branch called (Young Women's Christian Association) was opened.⁵⁴ By the convention held in Paris in 1855, 329 Y.M.C.A. organizations were established around the world. According to the decision taken at the congress, it was stated that the activities would be carried out under three main headings: spiritual, physical and social. A triangle symbolizing the unity of these three elements was chosen as the logo.⁵⁵ The Y.M.C.A. describes itself as a non-profit organization established to put Christian principles into practice through programs that build a healthy soul, mind, and body for all.⁵⁶ Y.M.C.A. has shown a wide range of practices in the field of sports activities since its inception. Although he is criticized for leading a missionary activity, there are formations that he pioneered in the spread and promotion of sports.⁵⁷ It is known that it is effective in the spread of many sports organizations in the world and Europe.⁵⁸ Especially before the establishment of the Republic, it is known that besides the missionary activities in the Ottoman period at the end of the 1800s, during the Turkish War of Independence, the Y.M.C.A. collected intelligence under the name of sports activities on behalf of the British intelligence.⁵⁹

According to an intelligence report prepared in 1931, the Y.M.C.A. movement was given great importance by the USA in the countries established after the First World War, and 56 branches with 2 million members were opened in countries such as Czechia, Slovakia, Poland, Estonia, Latvia, Finland, Hungary and Yugoslavia. It was stated that its registered members, and the expenses were generally collected through aid campaigns launched in the USA.⁶⁰ As

⁵¹ Frank Russell, *Finding The Enemy: Military Intelligence*, ed. B. Campbell and L. Tritle F., in *The Oxford Handbook of Warfare in the Classical World*, Oxford University Press, U.S 2013.

⁵² Nutuk [A Speech], *Kaynak Yayınları*, İstanbul 2015, p.31; Atatürk'ün Bütün Eserleri [The Work of Atatürk], *Kaynak Yayınları*, İstanbul 2003, p. 396.

⁵³ Kenneth S.Latourette, *World Service: A History of the Foreign Work and World Service of the Young Men's Christian Association of the United States and Canada*, Association Press, N.Y. 1957, p.24.

⁵⁴ Ahmet Uçar, *Hıristiyan Gençler Cemiyeti ve Türkiye'deki Faaliyetleri* [The Young Men's Christian Association (Y.M.C.A.) and activities in Turkey (1910-1939)], (PhD Thesis, İstanbul Üniversitesi Institute of Social Sciences, 2013), p. 43.

⁵⁵ Ivo Jirásek, "Sport and Religion: Muscular Christianity and the Young Men's Christian Association: Ideology, Activity and Expansion: (Great Britain, the United States and Poland, 1857-1939)", *Journal of the History of Sport*, 37, no.16 (2021), p. 1747.

⁵⁶ Y.M.C.A., "Our Mission and Our Values", <https://www.ymca.org/who-we-are>. (Date of access: 16.12.2021).

⁵⁷ Resul Çatalbaş, "Young Men's Christian Association'ın Türkiye'deki Faaliyetleri [Young Men's Christian Association's (YMCA) Activities in Turkey]", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 55, no.1 (2012), p. 105.

⁵⁸ Tomas Tlustý, "The YMCA Organisation and its Physical Education and Sports Activities in Europe During the First World War", *Prace Naukove Akademií*, 14, no.1 (2015), p. 36.

⁵⁹ Uçar, *ibid*, p. 2.

⁶⁰ *ibid*, p. 144.



it can be seen, at that time, sports became a fundamental element in the strategies of spreading to the world, and Christian evangelists worked through educational and social institutions such as Y.M.C.A.⁶¹

IV. 2. Mata Hari

Another example where a leisure time activity is used out of its purpose is the story of the dancer known as Margaretha Zelle or Mata Hari. The story of this dancer, who worked on the side of the Germans during World War I and was eventually shot by the French, draws attention.

The fact that she was an independent woman and was a spy enabled her to be seen as a valuable contributor of feminism due to the conditions of the period.⁶² There are many articles, books, movies about Mata Hari. Despite all the work done on her, there are differences of opinion about whether she is still an agent or an amateur who does not know much about these things. According to Ann Kramer, who defends the view that she is probably not even an agent, and that even so, she is very inexperienced compared to other women working in this field, the reason why Mata Hari attracted so much attention is stated as her different lifestyle, sexual life and tragic death.⁶³

The life adventure generally accepted in the literature is that she was born in the Netherlands, lived in the island of Java and Sumatra, was subjected to violence by her husband, her children were poisoned and the boy died because of this, divorced from her husband, modeled in Paris and worked in the circus and appeared on the stage with the "snake dance". She conveys the information gathered from French, Russian and British officers and statesmen to the Germans. She was shot on October 16, 1917, and her body was donated to Sarbonne Medical Faculty to be used in cadaver trainings.⁶⁴



"She abused our country's hospitality for years only to betray us",

Le Petit Parisien, 16 October 1917.

Picture 4. The death of Mata Hari in French Newspapers.

Romanian former football player Gheorghe Popescu is also an athlete who collects information for intelligence purposes and admits it while in sports. Romanian national football

⁶¹ Jirásek, *ibid*, p. 1750.

⁶² Dera Ardhiana, "Rebellion in Mata Hari the Spy by Paulho Coelho: A Feminist Analysis", Department of English Education School of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.

⁶³ Ann Kramer, *Women Wartime Spies (Women's History)*, Remember When, Australia 2011, p.36.

⁶⁴ Kürşad Berkkan, *İstihbarat Savaşları [Intelligence Wars]*, Eftalya Yayınları, İstanbul 2011, p.44.



player, who has a football career in Universitatea Craiova, Steaua Bucharest, PSV, Tottenham, Barcelona, Galatasaray, Lecce, Dinamo Bucharest, Hannover 96 teams, stated that he signed the document to show that he remained loyal to the national interests protection document during the period of Nicolae Ceausescu in the 1980s.⁶⁵ During this period, he admitted that he had reported four times about his teammates and officials while playing in the Universitatea Craiova team within the scope of information gathering activities for intelligence purposes.⁶⁶ Popescu defended himself by emphasizing that he did these things while the Communist regime was in power.

IV. 3. Technology, Leisure and Intelligence

Technology undoubtedly has numerous benefits. The economy of time has increased dependence on it in many areas, especially in transportation. It has practices in many areas depending on the use in modern life and the disappearance of boundaries.⁶⁷ However, it is clear that mobile applications, as well as individual and corporate use of the Internet, reveal important security vulnerabilities.⁶⁸ It was announced that between July and September 2021, when the Tokyo 2020 Olympic Games, including the Paralympic Games, began and ended, 450 million cyber-attacks were prevented.⁶⁹ It is known that the postponed Tokyo 2020 is the organization where the technology is used at the highest level (facial recognition technology) among the Olympic Games so far.⁷⁰ Despite fears that this large organization would be an easy target for hackers, another statistical fact is that there were fewer attacks during the Tokyo Games than during the London Games in 2012 and the Pyeongchang Winter Olympics in 2018. In the light of these data, it can be concluded that although technological developments create security weaknesses, by using the same developments, hacking can be prevented.

In a report prepared by the US Department of Justice; the allegation that six Russian intelligence officers carried out a cyber-attack on the 2018 Pyeongyang Winter Olympics in South Korea and showed that it was carried out by North Korea reveals another aspect of this issue.⁷¹ According to analysts, it is stated that it is evaluated as a response to the International Olympic Committee's (IOC) banning Russia from the Winter Olympics on doping grounds. During the opening ceremony, the experts noted the presence of a free seat in the stands due to interruptions in the supply of tickets due to problems in the broadcasting system, the Internet and the website, as well as the possibility of conducting intelligence activities to collect information and attempts to penetrate the network due to this weakness.⁷² In our recent history, the ways in which countries carry out activities to collect intelligence from other countries, integrating

⁶⁵ Dailymail, "Ex-Spurs Defender Popescu Admits Spying for the Romanian Secret Police" <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/sport/football/article-1197095/Ex-Spurs-defender-Popescu-admits-spying-Romanian-secret-police.html>. (Date of access: 16.12.2021).

⁶⁶ The Telegraph, "Gheorghe Popescu Denies Being Romanian Spy", https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/romania/5694117/Gheorghe-Popescu-denies-being-Romanian-spy.html?FORM=ZZNR6_. (Date of access: 16.12.2021).

⁶⁷ Vanessa Ratten, "Sport Technology: A Commentary", *Journal of High Technology Management Research*, no.31, (2020), p. 3.

⁶⁸ Seul-Ki Choi, Chung-Huang Yang, and Jin Kwak, "System Hardening and Security Monitoring for IoT Devices to Mitigate IoT Security Vulnerabilities and Threats", *KSII Transactions on Internet and Information Systems*, 12, no.2 (2018), p. 912.

⁶⁹ Japantimes, "Around 450 Million Cyberattacks Blocked During Tokyo Games", <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2021/10/05/national/2020-games-cyberattacks/> (Date of access: 18.12.2021).

⁷⁰ Austin Duckworth and Jörg Krieger, "The World will be Watching and so will NSA!: A History of Technology and Security at the Olympic Games", *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 38, no.2-3 (2021), p. 6.

⁷¹ Reuters, "Russian Hackers Attacked 2018 Olympics, 2017 French Election: U.S. Indictment", <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-olympics-2020-cyber-charges-idUSKBN2742E3> (Date of access: 20.12.2021).

⁷² Washington Post, "Russian Spies Hacked the Olympics and Tried to Make it Look Like North Korea Did it, U.S. Officials Say", https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/russian-spies-hacked-the-olympics-and-tried-to-make-it-look-like-north-korea-did-it-us-officials-say/2018/02/24/44b5468e-18f2-11e8-92c9-376b4fe57ff7_story.html. (Date of access: 20.12.2021).



it with technological developments, are controversial. A prime example is the case of Edward Snowden, a former Central Intelligence Agency official, as part of the US government's disclosure of allegations of covert surveillance programs.⁷³

Depending on the development of technology, artificial intelligence is becoming a form of today's threat in the form of new generation products, security vulnerabilities, cyber-attacks, especially with content.⁷⁴ This new technology in the literature in the form of IoT "Internet of things" is explained as the communication of smart devices with each other.⁷⁵ IoT consists of web-enabled smart devices that use built-in processors, sensors and communication hardware to collect, send and act on the data obtained from the environments.⁷⁶ Most products that people use today (smart-watches, toys, scales, robot vacuum cleaners, etc.) are examples of this technology. The prohibition of the sale of the doll named "My Friend Cayla" in Germany due to these threats is an example of the security weaknesses mentioned above. This sympathetic toy, which especially attracts the attention of children with its blonde hair and cute face, was put on the market by the US company Genesis in 2015 and it was stated that it had 1 million followers in 2016.⁷⁷ The uncertainty about where this cute baby, who answers the questions of its users via the web and records images and sounds, stores the data within the scope of information gathering activity, and more importantly, where it stores these data, for what purpose it is used, and whether the data are shared with third parties, have formed the basis of the investigations on the subject. Similarly, the same thing happened with the toy named "Hello Barbie". In 2016, toymaker V-Tech reported that 11.6 million accounts were compromised in a cyber-attack, including those of 6.3 million children. It has been reported that the photos, audio files, chat logs, and children's names, genders and birth dates of children and parents were accessed by hackers.⁷⁸ On December 06, 2016, the US Federal Trade Commission (FTC) started an investigation into the threat that these toys record and collect the private conversations of young children, without any limitation on the collection, use or disclosure of children's personal information.⁷⁹

In February 2017, Germany's Federal Network Agency (Bundesnetzagentur) announced that - wireless devices with hidden cameras or microphones are illegal in Germany - My Friend Cayla doll, which connects to the Internet wirelessly to answer questions because hackers can eavesdrop on children's conversations, is a spying device in this context.⁸⁰ The agency told

⁷³ The Guardian, "Edward Snowden: The Whistleblower Behind the NSA Surveillance Revelations", <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/09/edward-snowden-nsa-whistleblower-surveillance> (Date of access: 25.12.2021).

⁷⁴ Nektaria Kaloudi and Jingyue Li, "The AI-Based Cyber Threat Landscape: A Survey", *ACM Computing Surveys*, 53, no.1, (2020), p. 18.

⁷⁵ Somayya Madakam, R. Ramaswamy, Siddharth Tripathi, "Internet of Things (IoT): A Literature Review", *Journal of Computer and Communications*, 3, no.5, (2015), p. 6.

⁷⁶ Carlos Granell, Andreas Kamilaris, Alexander Kotsev, Frank Ostermann, and Sergi T. Oliver, "Internet of Things" in *Manual of Digital Earth* (2019), p. 401.

⁷⁷ Prnewswire, "New Free Game for World's Best Talking Doll My Friend Cayla", <https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/new-free-game-for-worlds-best-talking-doll-my-friend-cayla-300199658.html>. (Date of access: 17.12.2021).

⁷⁸ Emmeline Taylor and Katina Michael, "Smart Toys That are The Stuff of Nightmares", *IEEE Technology and Society Magazine*, 35, No.1 (2016), p. 9.

⁷⁹ FTC, "The Electronic Privacy Information Center The Campaign for a Commercial Free Childhood The Center for Digital Democracy Consumers Union. Genesis Toys and Nuance Communications", <https://epic.org/wp-content/uploads/privacy/kids/EPIC-IPR-FTC-Genesis-Complaint.pdf>. (Date of access: 18.12.2021).

⁸⁰ NY Times, "The Bright-Eyed Talking Doll That Just Might Be a Spy", <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/02/17/technology/cayla-talking-doll-hackers.html>. (Date of access: 19.12.2021).



parents of children with dolls to destroy their built-in microphone and banned future sales on that date.⁸¹

While the collected data can be used for good purposes, the point that worries the public here is that such technological advances can also be used by malicious people. Therefore, the relevant institutions of the countries have taken the necessary steps to prevent these security vulnerabilities.⁸² It is necessary to accept that the structure of war has changed, especially in the changing world conjuncture. In this new generation strategy, which is called hybrid warfare, political, military and psychological elements are used to achieve political goals and to be effective on the opponent side.⁸³ For this reason, the prohibitive attitude of countries to protect their citizens and borders against possible threats seems understandable in this respect.

We can increase the number of examples of banning applications that host various web-based software on the grounds that they can create security vulnerabilities. For example, we can talk about the banning of the game "Pokemon Go", which was released in 2016 by Niantic of America origin and Nintendo and The Pokemon Company of Japan origin, in terms of posing a threat to the security of geographical information with its GPS features. In fact, we can generally evaluate Location-Based Augmented Reality Games in this category. Since Pokemon Go is the most remarkable of these games, we will continue with this example. The game is based on catching the Pokemon characters in real life by going to certain addresses.⁸⁴ In order to collect Pokemon in the game and create your own collection, you have to wander the streets in the real environment. Shortly after the game was released, it was included in the discussions in terms of its individual benefits (increase in walking, movement time), positive effects such as increasing participation by entering churches, as well as negative aspects such as creating security weakness by going to military facilities.⁸⁵ As a result of the discussions, it was inevitable to intervene in this game played by millions of people due to security concerns. The game has been described as a component of the western information warfare in official Russian sources.⁸⁶ In addition, regarding the game, it was stated that Pokemon Go was banned by the Pentagon in all buildings and open areas within its jurisdiction, due to the concern that enemy intelligence might be camouflaged with this game.⁸⁷

It is known that Pokemon Go is banned in various countries around the world. The game is banned in Iran, Kuwait, China, Thailand, Philippines, Vietnam, Israel (military personnel were told not to use it on active duty), Indonesia, due to the intelligence security risks that may occur in sharing real maps and geolocation data. Bosnia and Herzegovina, USA, Russia,

⁸¹ Nir Kshetri and Jeffrey Voas, "Cyberthreats Under The BED", *IEEE Xplore Computers*, 51, no.5 (2018), p. 93.

⁸² Ingrida Milkaite and Eva Lievens, "Towards a Better Protection of Children's Personal Data Collected by Connected Toys and Devices", *Digital Freedom Fund*, <https://digitalfreedomfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/dff-essay-towards-better-protection-of-childrens-personal-data.pdf>. (Date of access: 22.12.2021).

⁸³ Michael Aaronson, Sverre Diessen, Yves De Kermabon, Mary B. Long and Michael Miklaucic, "NATO Countering the Hybrid Threat", *Prism*, 2, No.4 (2012), p. 115.

⁸⁴ Pokemongolive, "How Do I Find Specific Pokémon?", <https://niantic.helpshift.com/a/pokemon-go/?s=finding-evolving-hatching&f=how-do-i-find-specific-pokemon&l=tr&p=web>. (Date of access: 21.12.2021).

⁸⁵ Sonja Gabriel, "Pokemon Go How Religious Can an Augmented Reality Hunt Be?" *Heidelberg Journal of Religions on the Internet*, 12, no.17 (2017), p. 24.

⁸⁶ Keir Giles, (2016). "NATO Handbook of Russian Information Warfare", <https://www.ndc.nato.int/> (Date of access: 19.12.2021).

⁸⁷ The Guardian, "Pentagon's Pokémon Orders: Game Must Go (outside) for Security Reasons", <https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/aug/12/pentagon-pokemon-go-restrictions-security-concerns>. (Date of access: 21.12.2021).



and Poland stated that it is prohibited or restricted for different reasons (social, religious, cultural, etc.).⁸⁸ It is known that while playing Pokemon Go, there are people who were arrested due to the legal restrictions of the country or lost their lives due to the accident in the place where the game was played, as well as the concern that strategic military facilities could be used as an intelligence information source.⁸⁹

Another current example of computer games being banned by various countries for reasons such as security and violence is PUBG (Player Unknown's Battlegrounds). In the statement made by the CEO of Crafton company of South Korean origin in March 2021, it was announced that PUBG wind has reached 1 billion users worldwide.^{90,91} It has been stated that it has been banned due to various elements of violence in Bangladesh, Nepal, China, India, Jordan, Indonesia, Afghanistan, Pakistan - it has been reopened in some countries.^{92,93} India has banned over 100 applications, including PUBG, as they pose a threat to the defense and security of the country.⁹⁴ It is noteworthy that the recent political and military tensions with China played a role in India's decision to transfer player user data to other servers. The fact that the game was banned after 20 Indian soldiers lost their lives on the Chinese border supports this sensitivity.⁹⁵

Regarding information war, which is a branch of hybrid strategies, in 2016 Russian Minister of Culture Vladimir Medinskiy announced that the Netflix video service is funded by the US government as a way to "get into the minds of every individual of the Earth".⁹⁶ Again, this branch of leisure activities is an example of using it for different purposes. Another example of the concern that computer games pose a security threat to countries is revealed in documents sent by a former CIA agent to The Guardian and NY Times.⁹⁷ According to the related news, it is understood that the intelligence agencies, which are worried that terrorists or criminal networks may use the games to communicate secretly, transfer money or plan an attack, are doing this to prevent these threats. It has been stated that the institution monitors and records virtual chats in games such as World of Warcraft, Second Life, and Xbox Live, analyses the profiles of people in the games, some keywords they use in chat, money transfer traffic,

⁸⁸ Sportskeeda, "Is Pokemon Go Banned in Any Country?", <https://www.sportskeeda.com/pokemon/is-pokemon-go-banned-country>. (Date of access: 16.12.2021).

⁸⁹ Munir T. Makhmutov, Timur Asapov and Joseph A. Brown, "Safety Risks in Location-Based Augmented Reality Games", *Entertainment Computing*, Oct. (2021), p. 6.

⁹⁰ The Gamer, "PUBG Mobile Hits 1 Billion Downloads", <https://www.thegamer.com/pubg-mobile-hits-1-billion-downloads/> (Date of access: 18.12.2021).

⁹¹ PUBG Mobile (@PUBGMOBILE). "Players, please enjoy this special message from the CEO of Krafton. Thank you for being a part of our 1 billion downloads over the past 3 years", Twitter, March 24, 2021.

⁹² Shweta Sunil, Manoj K. Sharma and Nitin Anand, "Impact of Player Unknown's Battlegrounds (PUBG) on Mental Health", *Medico-Legal Journal*, 89, no.2 (2021), p. 66.

⁹³ BusinessToday, "Not Just in India, PUBG Mobile was Banned in These Countries in 2020", <https://www.businesstoday.in/amp/latest/trends/story/not-just-in-india-pubg-mobile-was-banned-in-these-countries-in-2020-283040-2020-12-30> (Date of access: 18.12.2021).

⁹⁴ Hindustan Times, "PUBG Mobile Ban", <https://tech.hindustantimes.com/gaming/news/pubg-mobile-ban-countries-that-launched-crack-down-against-this-popular-game-71629355511202.html>. (Date of access: 18.12.2021).

⁹⁵ Reuters, "Gamers Left Reeling as India Pulls Plug on Tencent's PUBG in China Spat", <https://www.reuters.com/article/india-china-apps-pubg-idUSKBN25U2H4>. (Date of access: 19.12.2021).

⁹⁶ Giles, *ibid*.

⁹⁷ Propublica, "World of Spycraft: NSA and CIA Spied in Online Games", <https://www.propublica.org/article/world-of-spycraft-intelligence-agencies-spied-in-online-games>. (Date of access: 15.12.2021).



and takes biometric photos from the cameras used in video chats. It has also been stated that the US intelligence agency cooperates with the British intelligence agency GCHQ.⁹⁸

Today, the use of technology in every field has another negative side that can affect individuals and even the masses. With this method, subliminal messages and various stimuli are sent to the subconscious of the users. Advertising, marketing, filmmaking, public relations, propaganda, debate and religion are all based on subliminal persuasion.⁹⁹ It is possible to see these methods of propaganda with message content in media, social media and computer games, especially within the scope of hybrid warfare techniques.¹⁰⁰ Today, the use of subliminal messages is also seen in many areas. It is possible to observe this especially in TV series, movies and computer games as a free time activity. Since this subject is an issue that needs to be examined in its own right, readers can access information about the subject from open sources in any way.

In this part of the study, a few examples of subliminal messages and propaganda in computer games will be mentioned. Recently, the West's Islamophobic concern towards Muslims shows itself in digital games as well as in the mainstream media.¹⁰¹ The rapid increase in the number of the Muslim population through immigration, increasing birth rates and conversions from Christianity to Islam causes Europeans to develop anxiety and fear that their content will be "Islamized" and that Christians will lose their dominance by becoming a minority against Muslims in their own country. A reflection of this fear is expressed by the term "Eurabia". Eurabia is to be named as the possibility of the Muslim majority in Europe after a few generations due to Muslim immigration to Europe and increasing Muslim birth rates. Many political parties use the idea of "Eurabia" as a fear tactic to gain public support.¹⁰² These anxieties and fears deliberately cause the initiatives to cause Islamophobia to be supported.¹⁰³

In the game Call of Duty: Modern Warfare 2, a tree-like frame standing on the wall behind the toilet seat in a toilet entered on the map of the "Favela" attracts attention. Although it is not noticeable when viewed with the naked eye, when viewed through gun binoculars, it is seen that verses from the holy book of Islam, the Koran, are written.¹⁰⁴ This situation has been met with a backlash by Muslims on the grounds of insulting Islam and reflecting a negative opinion towards this religion. The company then deleted and updated the map.¹⁰⁵ Another famous game, Counter-Strike, features terrorists and the team fighting them. Users are trying to kill terrorists by taking part in an anti-terrorism team. The destroyed terrorists, on the other hand, shout "Allahu Akbar and La Ilah Illallah" when an attack occurs on them. The expression of this Islamic discourse, which means "Allah is one" and "there is no God but Allah", by terrorists in the game is another example of how Muslims are called terrorists around the

⁹⁸ CNBC, "World of Spycraft: NSA Infiltrates Gamers' Data", <https://www.cnn.com/2013/12/09/world-of-spycraft-nsa-infiltrates-gamers-data.html>. (Date of access: 15.12.2021).

⁹⁹ Dave Lakhani, *Subliminal Persuasion. Influence & Marketing Secrets They Don't Want You to Know*, John Wiley & Sons Inc, New Jersey 2008, p.33.

¹⁰⁰ Haseeb U.R. Warrich, Sahrish Jamil and Fazal R. Khan, "Behavioral Escalation: Video Game as a Tool of Hybrid War", *Global Mass Communication Review*, 5, No.1 (2020), p. 74.

¹⁰¹ Bilal Yorulmaz, "Dijital Oyunlarda Müslüman Temsili" [Representation of Muslims in Digital Games], *MEDIAD*, 1, No. 2 (2018), p. 279.

¹⁰² Leora Moreno, "Fearing the Future: Islamophobia in Central Europe", *The New Presence*, No. 4 (2010), p. 76.

¹⁰³ Necmi Karşlı, "İslamofobi'nin Psikolojik Olarak İncelenmesi [Studying Islamophobia as Psychologically]", *Din Bilimleri Akademik Araştırma Dergisi [Religious Science Academic Research Journal]*, 13, No.3 (2013), p. 86.

¹⁰⁴ Sercan Tırnovalı, (2019). "Counter Intelligence Collection and Getting Information on Digital Games: Sample of Assassin's Creed", (Master Thesis, İstanbul Aydın University Social Sciences Institute, 2019), p. 39.

¹⁰⁵ Kotaku, "Modern Warfare Map Removed After Complaints from Muslim Gamers", <https://kotaku.com/modern-warfare-map-removed-after-complaints-from-muslim-5949764>. (Date of access: 25.12.2021).



world. Propaganda and subliminal message techniques, which are based on digital games for the Islamic world of the West, are manifested in many more computer games. In these games, Muslims are defined as the other and shown as enemies who need to be killed.¹⁰⁶ The Middle East, on the other hand, is a favourite battleground for digital games. In many games such as Kill Shot, FL Commando, War in the Gulf, Delta Force, Conflict: Desert Storm, Full Spectrum Warrior, Kuma/War, Conflict: Global Terror, the Middle East has been chosen as the battle venue.¹⁰⁷ Propaganda practices in games are also observed in different states and cultures. In the game Grand Theft Auto: Vice City, designed by a US company in 2003, Haitians and Cubans were represented as criminals, and it was intended that players would kill them.

As a response to Islamophobia, games developed by Muslim game manufacturers that symbolize Muslim representation by heroizing it can be considered as counter-propaganda activities. The Stone Throwers can be cited as an example of the games developed by these companies, which believe that Western game developers have distorted the image of Muslims.¹⁰⁸ Similarly, the Muslim resistance against Israel is discussed in the game Takhte'r-Ramad.^{109,110} Another game developed by Iran, Operation-e Vizbe -which was made against "Assault on Iran", in which US soldiers planning an attack against the nuclear program by entering Iran are shown as heroes-aims to rescue Iranian scientists working in the nuclear field captured by the United States.¹¹¹ In this respect, it is another important issue that themes of racial origin are frequently processed in violent games.¹¹²

It would be useful to discuss the reflections of the Russian invasion of Ukraine, which has been recently broken out from the perspective of sports and leisure time. In the process that started with the statement of Russian leader Putin on February 23, 2022, the negative atmosphere against Russia in the international public opinion in the face of the resistance of the Ukrainian people showed itself in many areas. The process, which started with economic sanctions in particular, continued with different protest practices and bans on various platforms. Many institutions, especially international federations, have banned Russia's participation in sports competitions. These decisions made by sports organizations were realized with the call of the International Olympic Committee (IOC) to international federations to cancel all planned events in Russia and Belarus or to hold them in another country.¹¹³

The game 2048 can be shown as an example as a cyber-attack within the scope of intelligence in the use of the latest developments in sports and leisure activities. This game developed by the Ukrainian IT (Information Technology) Army group contributes to the overloading of Russian websites (a kind of ddos) in the background while having fun at the same time.

¹⁰⁶ Yorulmaz, *ibid*, p. 280.

¹⁰⁷ Vit Sisler, "Digital Arabs: Representation in Video Games", *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 11, No.2 (2008), p. 210.

¹⁰⁸ Ed Halter, "Islamogaming: The State of Gaming in the Muslim World", *PC Magazine*, 25, No.3 (2006), p. 136.

¹⁰⁹ Yorulmaz, *ibid*, p. 282.

¹¹⁰ Sisler, *ibid*, p. 210.

¹¹¹ Yorulmaz, *ibid*, p. 283.

¹¹² Haseeb, Warrich, Jamil and Khan, *ibid*, p. 75.

¹¹³ Washingtonpost, "Sports Organizations are Benching Russian Teams over the Invasion of Ukraine", <https://www.washingtonpost.com/sports/2022/02/28/russian-sports-teams-banned-ukraine-invasion/> (Date of access: 04.03.2022).



¹¹⁴ Developers give the message “It creates a constant traffic to crash target Russian websites without giving it away.” to the gamers.¹¹⁵

Conclusion

At every stage of their lives, humankind has been in search of understanding what is happening around them. At the beginning of the historical process, a person who had the goal of housing, feeding his/her stomach and living his/her life briefly sought to collect information in order to learn about the developments in his/her environment and prevent possible threats that might happen to him/her. Especially with the formation of the concept of a nation-state and the emergence of borders, this quest has been realized through various methods within a certain discipline. Previously, only human-oriented intelligence-gathering activities showed themselves under the camouflage of activities such as dancing and singing, especially during World War II, as well as scouting activities, which were recreational activities. Thanks to the development of visual media in parallel with technology and advances in the field of the Internet, the fact that two forces collided on battlefields and shared their trumps has been replaced by the formation of different military strategies.

In today's world, propaganda practices that were discussed above and that can affect the masses along with the media and Internet applications are consumed by a lot of people for most of their free time. This can also be considered within the scope of soft power. These soft power applications, which are evaluated within the scope of hybrid warfare strategies, are preferred especially in terms of their ability to affect the masses. It is aimed to provide the desired message to the target audience with subliminal messages and scenarios contained in the content of consumption elements. In parallel with the unlimited progress of technology, developments in artificial intelligence and IoT in particular, although they offer extremely fun and fast facilities, security vulnerabilities in the form of cyber-attacks in the form of institutions or government come across as a form of threat today. The internet, social media and smart devices contribute to more disclosure and dissemination of critical information about emergencies and crisis events, and therefore of the news, and more quickly, and enable the sharing of confidential information leaks noticed.

When intelligence collection activities are examined from the past to present, free time activities such as sports, dance, scouting with the purpose of information gathering and propaganda activities have been used and collected from various sources described above. It has been observed that these activities are frequently used in products such as movies, computer games- The game launched by the Ukrainian IT Army group in the recent Russian intervention in Ukraine and targeting Russian target websites- especially with technology and artificial intelligence practices. It should be remembered that this information is a concrete image of the events that have been revealed. The absence of concrete disclosures that have not already appeared does not mean that these activities are not used in the background of free-time activities.

With the developing technology, the structure has been formed that covers various fields such as politics, propaganda, engineering by leaving the concept of war in which only soldiers

¹¹⁴ Nashkiev, “Play For Ukraine: An Analogue of 2048 has Appeared to Help ZSU”, <https://nashkiev.ua/news/play-for-ukraine-zyavivsy-analog-2048-dlya-dopomogi-zsu> (Date of access: 04.03.2022).

¹¹⁵ Playforukraine, “Play and Help to Stop the War”, <https://playforukraine.live/> (Date of access: 04.03.2022).



are involved in the field. Especially with technological advances, this complex structure seems to become even more complicated. In the planning of future wars, the importance of not only the superiority of armies in weapons and technology but also command and control of methods of influencing the masses, psychological warfare, hybrid strategy is great. In particular, in addition to intelligence gathering activities, states should update the intelligence cycle and counterintelligence mechanisms in accordance with the main purpose, and these updates should include regulations that will ensure that the elements work in harmony with each other.

Hakem Değerlendirmesi/Peer-review	Dış bağımsız / Externally peer-reviewed.
Yazar Katkı Oranı/Author Contribution Rate	%100
Finansal Destek ve Teşekkür/Grant Support and Acknowledgement	Yazar bu çalışma için finansal destek almadığını beyan etmiştir. / The author declared that this study has received no financial support.
Çıkar Çatışması/Conflict of Interest	Yazar çıkar çatışması bildirmemiştir. / The author have no conflict of interest to declare.



REFERENCES

A. Primary Sources Archive

Bridgeport Newspaper, April 13, 1917

Le Petit Parisien Newspaper, October 16, 1917

Library of Congress, The Peace of Westphalia, <https://blogs.loc.gov/law/2017/10/the-peace-of-westphalia/>

National Archives, The Committee of Secret Correspondence, <https://founders.archives.gov/documents/Franklin/01-22-02-0267>

New York Public Library, <https://www.nypl.org/blog/2014/10/07/spies-among-us-wwi-apl>

Nutuk [A Speech], p.31

Qur'an, Kehf:12.292-304

Torah, Numerus 13:1-23

B. Books, articles and others

AARONSON, Michael- Sverre Diessen- Yves De Kermabon- Mary B. Long- Michael Miklaucic, "NATO Countering the Hybrid Threat", *Prism*, C.2, S.4, 2012, p. 111–124.

AID, Matthew M., "All Glory is Fleeting: Sigint and the Fight Against International Terrorism", *Intelligence and National Security*, C.18, S.4, 2003, p. 72–120, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02684520310001688880>.

AK, M.Onur, "Integration of Technology into Sports from the Perspective of Sport Management: The Case of Cyathlon", *Pearson Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities*, 6, 16, 2021, p. 413-427, doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.46872/pj.445>.

AK, M.Onur, Toplumsal Cinsiyet Bağlamında Tarihsel Bakış Açısı ile Kadın ve Spor [Women and Sports with a Historical Perspective in the Context of Gender], in *Spor Bilimlerinde Teori ve Araştırmalar II [Theory and Research in Sport Sciences II]*, Gece, Ankara 2020.

ARDHIANA, Dera, "Rebellion in Mata Hari the Spy by Paulho Coelho: A Feminist Analysis", Department of English Education School of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.

ATAY, Mehmet, "Russia Secret Intelligence Services: A Brief History of the KGB", *Avrasya*, C.8, S.2, 2002, p.309-328.

AYSAL, Necdet, "Çöküşten Mütakereye Osmanlı'da Haber Alma [From collapse to armistice intelligence in the Ottoman Empire]", *Journal of Atatürk's Road* 40, 2007, p. 523-543.

BACASTOW Todd S- D. Bellaiore, "Redefining Geospatial Intelligence", *American Intelligence Journal*, C.27, S.1, 2009, p. 38-40.

BERKKAN, Kürşad, *İstihbarat Savaşları [Intelligence Wars]*, Eftalya, İstanbul 2011.

BIÇER, Savaş, "Transition from the Traditional Understanding of the National Security and Intelligence System to the Era of Modern and Changing Needs", *Black Sea Journal of Social Sciences*, C.9, S.2, 2017, p. 432-464.

BOZEMAN, Adda B., *Strategic Intelligence and Statecraft*, Brassey's, New York 1992.

BRITANNICA, "1st Baron Baden-Powell", <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Robert-Stephenson-Smyth-Baden-Powell-1st-Baron-Baden-Powell>. (accessed November 03, 2021).



- BUSINNESSTODAY, “Not Just in India, PUBG Mobile was Banned in These Countries in 2020”, <https://www.businessstoday.in/amp/latest/trends/story/not-just-in-india-pubg-mobile-was-banned-in-these-countries-in-2020-283040-2020-12-30> (accessed: December 18, 2021).
- ÇATALBAŞ, Resul, “Young Men’s Christian Association’ın Türkiye’deki Faaliyetleri [Young Men’s Christian Association’s (YMCA) Activities in Turkey]”, *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, C.55, S.1, 2012, p. 101-122. doi: 10.1501/Ilhfak_0000001406.
- CHOI, Seul-Ki- Chung-Huang Yang- Jin Kwak, “System Hardening and Security Monitoring for IoT Devices to Mitigate IoT Security Vulnerabilities and Threats”, *KSII Transactions on Internet and Information Systems*, S.12, C.2, 2018, p. 906-918, <http://doi.org/10.3837/tiis.2018.02.022>.
- CLARK, J.Ransom, *Intelligence and National Security a Reference Handbook*, Westport Praeger Security International, London 2007.
- CNBC, “World of Spycraft: NSA Infiltrates Gamers’ Data”, <https://www.cnn.com/2013/12/09/world-of-spycraft-nsa-infiltrates-gamers-data.html>. (accessed: December 15, 2021).
- COLERIDGE, Mary Elizabeth, *The Seven Sleepers of Ephesus*, Chatto&Windus, London 1893.
- COOPER, John P.D., *The Quenn’s Agent: Francis Walsingham at the Court of Elizabeth I*, Faber and Faber, London 2011.
- DAILYMAIL, “Ex-Spurs Defender Popescu Admits Spying For the Romanian Secret Police” <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/sport/football/article-1197095/Ex-Spurs-defender-Popescu-admits-spying-Romanian-secret-police.html>, (accessed: December 16, 2021).
- DARICI, Mevlüde Gökçen D., “Intelligence Activities in the Ottomans”, (PhD Thesis, Sivas Cumhuriyet University, 2018), p. 3.
- DAVIS, William C., *Spies, Scouts and Raiders*, Time Life Education, U.S 1986.
- DUCKWORTH, Austin- Jörg Krieger, “The World will be Watching and so will NSA! : A History of Technology and Security at the Olympic Games”, *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, C.38, S.2-3, 2021, p. 1-19, doi: 10.1080/09523367.2021.1909574.
- EVANS, Jacqueline R- Christian A. Meissner- Susan E. Brandon- Melissa B. Russano- Steve M. Kleinman, “Criminal Versus Humint Interrogations: The Importance of Psychological Science to Improving Interrogative Practice”, *The Journal of Psychiatry & Law* 38, 2010, p. 215–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009318531003800110>.
- FIDAN, Hakan, “Intelligence and Foreign Policy: A Comparison of British, American and Turkish Intelligence Systems”, (Master Thesis, Bilkent University Graduate School of Economics and Social Sciences, 1999), p. 11.
- FTC, “The Electronic Privacy Information Center The Campaign for a Commercial Free Childhood The Center for Digital Democracy Consumers Union. Genesis Toys and Nuance Communications”, <https://epic.org/wp-content/uploads/privacy/kids/EPIC-IPR-FTC-Genesis-Complaint.pdf>, (accessed: December 18, 2021).
- GABRIEL, Sonja, “Pokemon Go How Religious Can an Augmented Reality Hunt Be?” *Heidelberg Journal of Religions on the Internet*, C.12, S.17, 2017, p. 18-31.
- GILES, Keir, “NATO Handbook of Russian Information Warfare”, 2016, <https://www.ndc.nato.int/> (accessed: December 19, 2021).



- GLASSMAN, Michael- Min Ju Kang, "Intelligence in the Internet Age: The Emergence and Evolution of Open Source Intelligence (OSINT)", *Computers in Human Behavior*, C.28, S.2, 2012, p. 673-682, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2011.11.014>.
- GRANELL, Carlos- Andreas Kamilaris- Alexander Kotsev- Frank Ostermann- Sergi T. Oliver, "Internet of Things" in *Manual of Digital Earth*, 2019, p. 387-423. doi: 10.1007/978-981-32-9915-3_11.
- GRIES, D.D., "Openness and Secrecy", <https://www.cia.gov/static/b0b2b6a7ed15d42a0aacdb8d3f4a52e0/Openness-and-Secrecy.pdf>. (accessed October 12, 2021).
- HALTER, Ed, "Islamogaming: The State of Gaming in the Muslim World", *PC Magazine*, C.25, S.3, 2006, p. 136-137.
- HART, B.H. Liddell, *The Classical Book on Military Strategy (2nd Edition)*, Meridian Publishing, New York 1991.
- HINDUSTAN TIMES, "PUBG Mobile Ban", <https://tech.hindustantimes.com/gaming/news/pubg-mobile-ban-countries-that-launched-crackdown-against-this-popular-game-71629355511202.html>. (accessed: December 18, 2021).
- HUGHES, Stephanie- Fred Beasley, "An Examination of the Existence and Usage of Competitive Intelligence in Professional Sports", *Journal of Competitive Intelligence and Management*, C.4, S.1, 2007, p. 93-108.
- JAPANTIMES, "Around 450 Million Cyberattacks Blocked During Tokyo Games", <https://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2021/10/05/national/2020-games-cyberattacks/> (accessed: December 18, 2021).
- JIRÁSEK, Ivo, "Sport and Religion: Muscular Christianity and the Young Men's Christian Association: Ideology, Activity and Expansion: (Great Britain, the United States and Poland, 1857-1939)", *Journal of the History of Sport*, C.37, S.16, 2021, p. 1746-1748 doi: 10.1080/09523367.2020.1824489.
- JOINT PUBLICATION, "Joint and National Intelligence Support to Military Operations 2-01", https://www.jcs.mil/Portals/36/Documents/Doctrine/pubs/jp2_01_20170705v2, 169. (accessed: December 16, 2021).
- JOSEPH, Uri Bar, *Intelligence Intervention in The Politics of Democratic States, The United States, Israel and Britain, Pennsylvania*, Pennsylvania University Press, U.S 1999).
- KAHN, David, "Historical Theory of Intelligence", *Avrasya* C.8, S.2, 2002, p. 5-20.
- KALOUDI, Nektaria- Jingyue Li, "The AI-Based Cyber Threat Landscape: A Survey", *ACM Computing Surveys*, C.53, S.1, 2020, p. 1-34, <https://doi.org/10.1145/3372823>.
- KARSLI, Necmi, İslamofobi'nin Psikolojik Olarak İncelenmesi [Studying Islamophobia as Psychologically], *Din Bilimleri Akademik Araştırma Dergisi [Religious Science Academic Research Journal]*, C.13, S.3, 2013, 2013, p. 75-100.
- KAYNAK YAYINLARI, Atatürk'ün Bütün Eserleri [The Work of Atatürk], Kaynak Yayınları, İstanbul 2003.
- KENT, Sherman, *Strategic Intelligence For American World Policy*, Archon Books, U.S 1965.
- KOTAKU, "Modern Warfare Map Removed After Complaints From Muslim Gamers", <https://kotaku.com/modern-warfare-map-removed-after-complaints-from-muslim-5949764>. (accessed: December 25, 2021).



- KRAMER Ann, *Women Wartime Spies (Women's History)*, Remember When, Australia 2011.
- KROKUS, Christian S., "The Darkness is not Death: Toward a Christian-Muslim Comparative Theological Study of the Seven Sleepers of Ephesus", *Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality* C.17, S.1, 2017, p. 40-59. doi: 10.1353/scs.2017.0003.
- KSHETRI, Nir- Jeffrey Voas, "Cyberthreats Under The BED", *IEEE Xplore Computers*, C.51, S.5, 2018, p. 92-95, doi:10.1109/MC.2018.2381121.
- LAKHANI, Dave, *Subliminal Persuasion. Influence & Marketing Secrets They Don't Want You to Know*, John Wiley & Sons Inc, New Jersey 2008.
- LARSON, Kate C., "Harriet Ross Tubman: Timeline", *Meridians: Feminism, Race, Transnationalism*, C.12, S.2, 2014, p. 9-27, <https://doi.org/10.2979/meridians.12.2.9>.
- LATOURETTE, Kenneth S., *World Service: A History of the Foreign Work and World Service of the Young Men's Christian Association of the United States and Canada*, Association Press, New York 1957.
- LEORA Moreno, "Fearing the Future: Islamophobia in Central Europe", *The New Presence*, No. 4, 2010, p. 73-80.
- MADAKAM, Somayya- R. Ramaswamy- Siddharth Tripathi, "Internet of Things (IoT): A Literature Review", *Journal of Computer and Communications*, C.3, S.5, 2015, p. 1-10, doi: 10.4236/jcc.2015.35021.
- MAKHMUTOV, Munir T- Timur Asapov- Joseph A. Brown, "Safety Risks in Location-Based Augmented Reality Games", *Entertainment Computing*, Oct. 2021, p. 1-9, doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-89394-1_39.
- MARGOLIS, Gabriel, "The Lack of HUMINT: A Recurring Intelligence Problem", *Global Security Studies*, C.4, S.3, 2013, p. 43-60.
- MASCIANDARO, Donato, "Financial Supervisory Unification and Financial Intelligence Units", *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, 8, 4, 2005, p. 354-370, <https://doi.org/10.1108/13685200510620858>.
- MICHAEL Herman, *Intelligence Power in Peace and War*, Cambridge University Press, UK 1996.
- MILKAITE, Ingrida- Eva Lievens, "Towards a Better Protection of Children's Personal Data Collected by Connected Toys and Devices", *Digital Freedom Fund*, <https://digitalfreedomfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/dff-essay-towards-better-protection-of-childrens-personal-data.pdf>, (accessed: December 22, 2021).
- NASHKIEV, "Play For Ukraine: An Analogue of 2048 has Appeared to Help ZSU", <https://nashkiev.ua/news/play-for-ukraine-zyavivsyia-analog-2048-dlya-dopomogi-zsu> (accessed: March 04, 2022).
- NEWMAN, Bernard, *Alman Casusluğunun Esrarı [The Mystery of German Espionage]*, (İstanbul: Altın, 1940):7, quoted in Mehmet Gürbüz, *Amerikan İstihbaratının Tarihsel Gelişim Süreci ve Amerikan İstihbarat Topluluğu Modeli [Historical Development Process of American Intelligence and American Intelligence Community]*, (PhD Thesis, Police Academy Institute of Security Sciences, 2018).
- NIZÂMÜ'L-MÜLK, *Siyâsetnâme [Policy]*, trans. Mehmet Taha Ayar, (İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları, 2014).
- NY TIMES, "The Bright-Eyed Talking Doll That Just Might Be a Spy", <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/02/17/technology/cayla-talking-doll-hackers.html>. (accessed: December 19, 2021).



- ÖZDAĞ, Ümit, *İstihbarat Teorisi [Intelligence Theory]*, Kripto, Ankara 2014.
- PATRICK M., “Masint”, *American Intelligence Journal*, C.36, S.2, 2019, p. 7-10.
- PHILPOTT, Daniel, “Westphalia, Authority, and International Society”, *Political Studies* XLVII, 1999, p. 266-589. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9248.00217>.
- PLAYFORUKRAINE, “Play and Help to Stop the War”, <https://playforukraine.live/> (accessed: March 04, 2022).
- POKEMONGOLIVE, “How Do I Find Specific Pokémon?”, <https://niantic.helpshift.com/a/pokemon-go/?s=finding-evolving-hatching&f=how-do-i-find-specific-pokemon&l=tr&p=web>. (accessed: December 21, 2021).
- Powell, R. Baden, *Scouting for Boys*, Dover, New York 1908.
- PRINGLE, Robert W., “The Heritage and Future of the Russian Intelligence Community”, *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence*, C.11, S.2, 1998, p. 175-184, doi: 10.1080/08850609808435371.
- PRNEWSWIRE, “New Free Game for World’s Best Talking Doll My Friend Cayla”, <https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/new-free-game-for-worlds-best-talking-doll-my-friend-cayla-300199658.html>. (accessed: December 17, 2021).
- PROPUBLICA, “World of Spycraft: NSA and CIA Spied in Online Games”, <https://www.propublica.org/article/world-of-spycraft-intelligence-agencies-spied-in-online-games>. (accessed: December 15, 2021).
- PUBG MOBILE (@PUBGMOBILE). “Players, please enjoy this special message from the CEO of Krafton. Thank you for being a part of our 1 billion downloads over the past 3 years”, Twitter, March 24, 2021, 03.01 p.m, https://twitter.com/PUBGMOBILE/status/1374511705003229192?ref_src=twsrc%5Etfw%7Ctwcamp%5Etweetembed%7Ctwterm%5E1374511705003229192%7Ctwgr%5E%7Ctwcon%5Es1_&ref_url=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.pokemongolive.com
- RATTEN, Vanessa, “Sport Technology: A Commentary”, *Journal of High Technology Management Research*, no.31, 2020, p. 1-6, doi:10.1016/j.hitech.2020.100383.
- RENNER, Britta, “Curiosity About People: The Development Of a Social Curiosity Measure in Adults”, *Journal Of Personality Assessment* 83, 2006, p. 305-316. doi:10.1207/s15327752jpa8703_11.
- RESEARCHANDMARKETS, “Sports Global Market Report 2021: COVID-19 Impact and Recovery to 2030”, <https://www.researchandmarkets.com/reports/5240315/sports-global-market-report-2021>. (accessed November 02, 2021).
- REUTERS, “Gamers Left Reeling as India Pulls Plug on Tencent’s PUBG in China Spat”, <https://www.reuters.com/article/india-china-apps-pubg-idUSKBN25U2H4>. (accessed: December 19, 2021).
- REUTERS, “Russian Hackers Attacked 2018 Olympics, 2017 French Election: U.S. Indictment”, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-olympics-2020-cyber-charges-idUSKBN2742E3>, (accessed: December 20, 2021).
- RICHELSON, Jeffrey T., “Masint: The New Kid in Town”, *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence* C.14, S.2, 2001, p. 149-192, <https://doi.org/10.1080/088506001300063136>.
- RICHELSON, Jeffrey T., *The US Intelligence Community*, Westviews Press, Philadelphia 2012.



- ROHM, Fredric W- Bramwell Osula, "Scouting and Servant Leadership in Cross-Cultural Perspective: An Exploratory Study", *Journal of Virtues & Leadership*, C.3, S.1, 2013, p. 26-42.
- ROUX, Jean Paul, *Türklerin Tarihi: Pasifik'ten Akdeniz'e 2000 Yıl [Histoire Des Turcs - Deux mille ans du Pacifique a la Mediterranee]*, Arthème Fayard, France 2000.
- RT, "World Better not Pry Into How We Decide to Pull Trigger on Someone – Ex-Chief of Mossad", <https://www.rt.com/shows/sophieco/370707-mossad-counter-terrorism-methods/> (accessed October 15, 2021)
- RUSSELL, Frank, *Finding The Enemy: Military Intelligence*, ed. B. Campbell and L. Tritle F., in *The Oxford Handbook of Warfare in the Classical World*, (US: Oxford University Press, 2013), doi: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780195304657.013.0024.
- SATHYE Milind- Chris Patel, "Developing Financial Intelligence: an Assessment of The FIUs in Australia and India", *Journal of Money Laundering Control*, C.10, S.4, 2007, p. 391-405, doi: 10.1108/13685200710830880
- SHULSKY Abram N- Gary J. Schmitt, *Silent Warfare Understanding the World of Intelligence*, Brassey's, Washington 1993.
- SISLER, Vit, "Digital Arabs: Representation in Video Games", *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, C.11, S.2, 2008, p. 203-220, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1367549407088333>.
- SPORTSKEEDA, "Is Pokemon Go Banned in Any Country?", <https://www.sportskeeda.com/pokemon/is-pokemon-go-banned-country>. (accessed: December 16, 2021).
- SUNIL, SHWETA, Manoj K.Sharma- Nitin Anand, "Impact of Player Unknown's Battlegrounds (PUBG) on Mental Health", *Medico-Legal Journal*, C.89, S.2, 2021, p. 64-70, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0025817220981817>.
- TAYLOR, Emmeline- Katina Michael, "Smart Toys That are The Stuff of Nightmares", *IEEE Technology and Society Magazine*, C.35, S.1, 2016, p. 8-10, doi: 10.1109/MTS.2016.2527078.
- THE GAMER, "PUBG Mobile Hits 1 Billion Downloads", <https://www.thegamer.com/pubg-mobile-hits-1-billion-downloads/>. (accessed: December 18, 2021).
- THE GUARDIAN, "Edward Snowden: The Whistleblower Behind the NSA Surveillance Revelations", <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2013/jun/09/edward-snowden-nsa-whistleblower-surveillance>, (accessed: December 25, 2021).
- THE GUARDIAN, "Pentagon's Pokémon Orders: Game Must Go (outside) for Security Reasons", <https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/aug/12/pentagon-pokemon-go-restrictions-security-concerns>. (accessed: December 21, 2021).
- THE TELEGRAPH, "Gheorge Popescu Denies Being Romanian Spy", <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/romania/5694117/Gheorghe-Popescu-denies-being-Romanian-spy.html?FORM=ZZNR6>, (accessed: December 16, 2021).
- TIRNOVALI, Sercan, "Counter Intelligence Collection and Getting Information on Digital Games: Sample of Assassin's Creed", (Master Thesis, İstanbul Aydın University Social Sciences Institute, 2019), p. 39.
- TLUSTY, Tomas, "The YMCA Organisation and its Physical Education and Sports Activities in Europe During the First World War", *Prace Naukowe Akademii*, C.14, S.1, 2015, p. 27-44. <http://dx.doi.org/10.16926/kf.2015.14.02>.
- TROY, Thomas F., "The Correct Definition of Intelligence", *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence*, C.5, S.4, 1991, p. 433-454.



- UÇAR, Ahmet, Hıristiyan Gençler Cemiyeti ve Türkiye'deki Faaliyetleri [The Young Men's Christian Association (Y.M.C.A.) and activities in Turkey (1910-1939)], (PhD Thesis, İstanbul Üniversitesi Institute of Social Sciences, 2013).
- ÜNVER, Akın H., "Digital Open Source Intelligence and International Security", *Edam Cyber Politics and Digital Democracy*, C.7, 2018, p. 1-30.
- VAUGHAN, Arthur O., "Some Scouts-But not Scouting", *Longman's Magazine 1882-1905*, C.43, S.255, 1904, p. 227-241.
- WALKER, James R., "The Rise of GEOINT: Technology, Intelligence and Human Rights", *Visual Imagery and Human Rights Practice*, 2018, p. 67-88. doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-75987-6_5.
- WARNER, Michael, "The Divine Skein: Sun Tzu on Intelligence", *Intelligence and National Security*, C.21, S.4, 2007, p. 483-492. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02684520600885624>.
- WARREN, Allen, "Sir Robert Baden-Powell, the Scout Movement and Citizen Training in Great Britain, 1900-1920", *The English Historical Review*, 1986, p. 376-398, <https://doi.org/10.1093/ehr/CI.CCCXCIX.376>.
- WARRICH, Haseeb U.R- Sahrish Jamil- Fazal R. Khan, "Behavioral Escalation: Video Game as a Tool of Hybrid War", *Global Mass Communication Review*, 5, No.1, 2020, p. 68-82. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gmcr.2020\(V-I\).06](https://doi.org/10.31703/gmcr.2020(V-I).06).
- WASHINGTONPOST, "Russian Spies Hacked the Olympics and Tried to Make it Look Like North Korea Did it, U.S. Officials Say", https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/national-security/russian-spies-hacked-the-olympics-and-tried-to-make-it-look-like-north-korea-did-it-us-officials-say/2018/02/24/44b5468e-18f2-11e8-92c9-376b4fe57ff7_story.html. (accessed: December 20, 2021).
- WASHINGTONPOST, "Sports Organizations are Benching Russian Teams over the Invasion of Ukraine", <https://www.washingtonpost.com/sports/2022/02/28/russian-sports-teams-banned-ukraine-invasion/> (accessed: March 04, 2022).
- Y.M.C.A., "Our Mission and Our Values", <https://www.ymca.org/who-we-are>. (accessed: December 16, 2021).
- YORULMAZ, Bilal, "Dijital Oyunlarda Müslüman Temsili" [Representation of Muslims in Digital Games], *MEDIAD*, C.1, S.2, 2018, p. 275-286.